Data & Mapping Sub-Committee

Meeting Packet Table of Contents

Pennsylvania Broadband Development Authority
Data & Mapping Sub-Committee Meeting
Wednesday, January 18th, 2023
2:00 PM – 3:00 PM

Virtual Meeting
Dial-In: +1 267-332-8737
Phone Conference ID: 180 157 00#

I.   Call to Order

II.   Approval of January 4, 2023, Meeting Minutes

III. FCC Map Challenge Update

    a. Availability Challenge Submission

        i. Statewide Challenge Trends

    b. Location Challenge Update

    c. Committee Feedback on PBDA Mapping Efforts

        i. Broadband Hub Examples

        ii. Proposed Data Layers

IV.   Public Comment

V.   Adjournment

We are recording this meeting and your participation is your consent to being recorded

Pennsylvania Broadband Development Authority
Data & Mapping Sub-Committee Meeting Minutes
Wednesday, January 4th, 2023
Microsoft Teams Meeting

Board members and voting designees in attendance:

- Lisa Schaefer, County Commissioners Association of Pennsylvania, Chair
- Vice-Chair Kiger, PA One Call, Vice-Chair
- Dr. Kyle Kopko, Center for Rural Pennsylvania
- Chris Cap, Pennsylvania State Association of Boroughs
- Steve Schwerbel, Wireless Internet Service Providers Association
- Jay Summerson, Microsoft
- Julie Tritt Schell, PA E-Rate Coordinator
- Gary Zingaretti, Zingaretti Enterprises

Department of Community and Economic Development (DCED) staff in attendance:

- Kalie Snyder
- Kyle Snyder
- Renee Reynolds

Guests in attendance:

- Matthew Franchak, PA Senate
- Jim Mercante, Southern Chester County Digital Equity Coalition
- Emme Reiser, Pennsylvania Association of Realtors
- Nicole Ugarte, NTIA
- Brian Kimmett
- Philip Jones
- John Mercuri
- Bethany Pursell
- Paige Oliver, Ichor Strategies
- Jennifer Blatz
- Jessica Sahl
- Chris Utesch
- Paul Desruisseau
- Sam Haulman
- Sean Carlton, Michael Baker International

I. **Call to Order**

    Chair Schaefer called the meeting to order at 2:01 PM.
    Kyle Snyder conducted a roll call of the sub-committee members.

II. **Approval of December 21, 2022 Meeting Minutes**

    Chair Schaefer called for questions and comments regarding the meeting minutes as presented to
    the sub-committee for the sub-committee meeting held on December 21, 2022.

Chair Schaefer called for a motion to approve the minutes. Motion made by Vice-Chair Kiger. Motion was seconded by Julie Tritt Schell. Chair Schaefer asked if any sub-committee members had any objection to the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

III.   **FCC Map Challenge Update**

Chair Schaefer noted that there are two main focuses for the sub-committee meeting. The first focus was to discuss the map challenge efforts of Penn State Extension and where Pennsylvania's challenge stands. The second focus was to discuss the sub-committee's role moving forward after the FCC map challenge process is completed.

Chair Schaefer introduced Jim Ladlee from Penn State Extension to provide an overview of the Penn State Extension map challenge work. Jim noted that there was a recently updated release of the Cost Quest Fabric and that the team was working through the data. He stated that Penn State was undertaking a survey of broadband service around the Commonwealth. Jim estimated that Penn State was approximately 98% of the way through the surveying efforts and they anticipated completion of surveys by January 6th, 2023. He stated that a team of 20 people had surveyed approximately 14,000 locations as part of the analysis. The surveys helped to identify areas where data is inconsistent or where broadband coverage has been overstated. Jim noted that he would have additional data prepared for the sub-committee meeting, but the recent release of the Cost Quest Fabric had proved to be a challenge.

Chair Schaefer had asked for additional information regarding the Cost Quest Fabric update. Jim had noted that Kyle Snyder should probably provide clarification. Kyle Snyder stated that the Cost Quest Associates data sharing agreement specifies that the Fabric data will be updated on a semiannual basis. The initial Fabric release was dated "As of June 30th, 2022" and the updated release was dated "As of December 31st, 2022." A challenge report was also provided, but the documentation was difficult to understand. Jim noted that in some cases certain providers do not publish coverage information for addresses. He said the Penn State Extension team is working with some providers to get that information directly. Jim noted that he believes the Penn State Extension team is making good progress and will have additional information at the 1/18/23 sub-committee meeting.

Vice-Chair Kiger noted that PA One Call has 4,000 members participating as part of utilities, or municipal entities. Vice-Chair Kiger asked if the Authority could provide a written statement for outreach. PA One Call could directly notify all participating members to help with outreach efforts. Jim Ladlee had asked if this would be used for individual or bulk challenges. Vice-Chair Kiger noted that this could be used for both individual and bulk challenges. Kyle Snyder stated that he will reach out to Vice-Chair Kiger and Jim Ladlee after the meeting for additional information.

Julie Tritt Schell had asked Jim Ladlee if there is any information about trends from the data analysis. She had asked if there are specific service providers overstating coverage in a certain area of if there's any other type of trends within the data. Jim Ladlee stated that some areas or providers will have more challenges but did not want to provide specific information due to the new release of Fabric data. Jim noted that he was hesitant for being general with his remarks but wanted to wait until there was more specific information. Julie Tritt Schell had asked if the FCC

expects entities to use the most recent Fabric for submitting bulk challenges. Kyle Snyder noted that it is difficult to determine that. Kyle stated that other states have already submitting bulk location challenges. Kyle also noted that he was unsure to what extent other states are pursuing bulk service availability challenges. Kyle had asked if Nicole Ugarte from NTIA would offer additional comments. Nicole noted that the FCC's focus is on the submission of service availability challenges for the BEAD allocation. Nicole stated that she is waiting on approval from the FCC to release early estimates of challenge numbers.

Julie Tritt Schell asked what Penn State's role is after the January 13th map challenge process. Jim Ladlee noted that Penn State Extension will continue to work with the Authority at least until June 2023. He noted that Penn State will continue to work on mapping efforts and tentatively sees that data being given to the Authority. Jim stated that Penn State Extension is focused on the service availability challenges, but the location challenges will play a role in providing updated information for the broadband maps.

Dr. Kyle Kopko asked for some clarification on what triggered the Cost Quest Fabric update. Kyle Snyder noted that the Cost Quest Fabric is set to be released on a semi-annual basis. The intention is for the Broadband Data Collection (BDC) information to replace the FCC Form 477 Data. Kyle Snyder noted that the data is now at the address level as opposed to being at the Census Block level. Kyle Snyder stated his understanding is that the new BDC data will be a living product and be continued to be updated. Nicole Ugarte added that this Fabric update will include the initial round of challenges which ended in October 2022. She also stated that the FCC/NTIA is encouraging entities to continue to submit challenges even after the January 13th deadline. Dr. Kopko asked if the current challenges submitted would be considered as part of future fabric updates. Nicole Ugarte said that is correct.

Chair Schaefer asked if the FCC National Broadband Map includes individual challenges. Nicole Ugarte stated that the FCC has noted that it is updating the map every 2 weeks, but specific information regarding what has been updated is not shared. Nicole Ugarte noted that the focus right now is to determine the BEAD allocations. Nicole noted that there will be another challenge process, but this will be developed at the statewide level and the guidelines will be established by the PA Broadband Development Authority. She said that no state is required to use the National Broadband Map to determine how their BEAD allocation is use. Many states are opting to build their own broadband fabrics to support their own statewide programs. Chair Schaefer asked if there was a number for the total amount of challenges submitted within Pennsylvania. Nicole Ugarte said that she is trying to find out when that information can be released. Chair Schaefer asked Jim Ladlee if there are general trends from the survey's completed by Penn State Extension. Jim Ladlee explained that the Penn State team is still checking the Fabric update, so he did not want to give specifics regarding number of challenges in case that is impacted by the updated Fabric data. Jim also explained that the surveys were intended to confirm whether broadband service can be verified at the given address surveyed.

Chair Schaefer asked how an entity would receive the updated Cost Quest Fabric. Kyle Snyder noted that you must have an existing data sharing agreement with Cost Quest Associates to receive the fabric data and subsequent updates. Kyle noted that the PA Broadband Development Authority is a licensee and had to have additional data sharing agreements just to share with Penn

State Extension. Kyle Snyder noted that he would guess that you must be an existing licensee to get access to the Fabric. Vice-Chair Kiger stated that the data is restricted in how it can be shared. Kyle Snyder explained that there are significant restrictions on licensees on what information they can/cannot share.

Kyle Snyder noted that the Authority is preparing a bulk location challenge. Kyle stated that the service availability challenge is the primary determination for BEAD allocation, but the location challenge is important for having a corrected dataset. The Authority is has received data from PEMA for 911 addressing data. Kyle Snyder noted this dataset only covers approximately half of Pennsylvania's counties. He stated that additional data requests are being sent out to individual counties to supplement data from other partners. Chair Schaefer noted that a follow up request was sent out through CCAP for GIS data. Kyle Snyder noted that the location challenges are being accepted on an on-going basis by the FCC. He stated that the Authority will be collecting location challenges beyond the January 13th deadline and reiterated that the Authority is on track to submit a service availability challenge by January 13th.

Chair Schaefer asked those in attendance if they had any additional questions regarding the map challenge update.

IV. **Committee Role After FCC Map Challenge Deadline (1/13/23)**

Chair Schaefer noted that there was discussion regarding the sub-committee's role was following the January 13th map challenge deadline. Chair Schaefer asked Kyle Snyder if he would speak a little more regarding this. Kyle Snyder noted that his initial thoughts were to create a public facing website (or "hub") for all things related to broadband mapping within Pennsylvania. This hub would be comprised of documentation, information, maps, and data pertaining to broadband within Pennsylvania. Kyle Snyder said that other states, like Connecticut, have these public-facing sites which provide a comprehensive look at broadband mapping and status. Kyle Snyder noted that this hub site is a preliminary thought but would like to get feedback and input from the sub-committee on data and information to be used. Kyle Snyder stated that he would like feedback on what data the public would like to consume or if internet service providers could provide infrastructure data. Kyle Snyder stated that he envisions the statewide planning efforts to be "map-centric" just as the current FCC challenge is based around the National Broadband Map.

Chair Schaefer clarified that the FCC National Broadband Map will be used to determine Pennsylvania's BEAD allocation, and then Pennsylvania will build its own map to help guide statewide investments. Kyle Snyder stated that is correct. He also noted that many statewide guidelines are tentative, and the primary focus is working on maximizing our BEAD allocation from the FCC/NTIA. Kyle Snyder stated that the sub-committee input is wanted to help drive how we use data to make these decisions for the statewide program. Chair Schaefer brought up the Pennsylvania State Broadband Plan and wanted to know if additional guidance from the Authority will be provided to help inform what data will be needed to meet these goals. Kyle Snyder stated that the Statewide Broadband Plan is to be considered a living document and is subject to future updates. He also stated that he is coordinating with other state agencies on building a data/mapping strategy.

Vice-Chair Kiger stated that PA One Call has been working on coordinating data collection for fiber projects around the Commonwealth through the Coordinate PA program. They have roughly 7,396 fiber projects currently underway and logged in the Coordinate PA system. Vice-Chair Kiger noted that these project areas are mapped, and PA One Call could provide the data. Jim Ladlee stated

that this PA One Call data would be very helpful for the cost-estimating work that Penn State Extension is set to do. Vice-Chair Kiger noted that Pennsylvania Law requires notification by those excavating that are performing work and participation by fiber carriers. Vice-Chair Kiger stated that this data is available by county and will be willing to relay a data request to all providers on behalf of the Authority. Kyle Snyder stated that he will follow up and provide that data request to PA One Call.

Chair Schaefer asked if there were any thoughts or initial feedback on data or layer. Vice-Chair Kiger stated that PA One Call could provide information down the County level if a request is submitted. PA One Call's Board has a Telecom and TV board representatives. Julie Tritt Schell asked if and how the sub-committee will be presented with data. She asked if the sub-committee members would be shown examples of maps and they would offer feedback directly to the examples shown. Julie Tritt Schell noted that she thinks about how maps can be useful. Kyle Snyder stated that he can provide examples of data what other states are doing as well as layers that the Authority currently has access to. He noted that there could be an iterative process with the sub-committee to show examples of draft maps and seek feedback from the sub-committee. Vice-Chair Kiger noted that a thematic map may want to be created. Julie Tritt Schell said it would be helpful to receive examples. She also noted that she has an education-based perspective. Julie Tritt Schell noted that she would like to see school district and intermediate unit boundaries shown on a map. She asked if there was a way to incorporate progressive disclosure questions to provide a more tailored experience. Kyle Snyder said that he would investigate the progressive disclosure approach. He also noted that tailored maps could be provided as well.

Vice-Chair Kiger asked for direction from the Board. Dr. Kyle Kopko noted that we need to think about what data would be useful for the grant progress moving forward. The maps that Pennsylvania will use are up to the state. Dr. Kopko urged the sub-committee members to speak with their constituents about what information would be useful. Kyle Snyder said that for the next sub-committee meeting he can provide examples and we can step through some other state examples. Kyle Snyder said that he would provide examples in advance of the next sub-committee meeting.

Chair Schaefer asked those in attendance if there were any additional topics to be discussed today.

VI.   Public Comment

Chair Schaefer called for public comment.

Jim Mercante wanted to thank Kyle Snyder, Harry Chrissy, Tom Beresnyak, Paul Fritz for working with the Southern Chester County Digital Equity Coalition in the bulk challenge efforts. Jim Mercante also noted that letters were sent out through Senator Kane's office, the Southern Chester County Chamber of Commerce for data requests to help support the challenge process. Jim reiterated his thanks for those who have assisted Southern Chester County. Jim Mercante introduced himself as the Co-Chair of the Southern Chester County Digital Equity Coalition.

X.   Meeting Adjournment

Chair Schaefer stated that the next meeting would be January 18th at 2:00PM. She asked if Dr. Kyle Kopko had any additional comments from the board. Dr. Kopko thanked the sub-committee. Chair Schaefer asked Kyle Snyder if he had any additional comments. Kyle Snyder asked if the

sub-committee members could continue to push the challenge process. Kyle Snyder noted that the Authority has created a bulk challenge template file. Any questions regarding the map challenge process can be directed to Kyle Snyder or Lisa Schaefer.

Chair Schaefer called for a motion to adjourn. Motion to adjourn was made by Vice-Chair Kiger. Motion seconded by Seve Schwerbel. Meeting adjourned at 2:53 PM.